

ON THE TERM *ALBIGENSIANS* IN 13TH CENTURY HISPANIC SOURCES

MARTÍN ALVIRA CABRER
UNIVERSIDAD COMPLUTENSE DE MADRID
SPAIN

Date of reception: 20th of January, 2007

Final date of acceptance: 7th of March, 2008

ABSTRACT

This study analyses the terms used in 13th-century Hispanic sources for the Cathar heretics in Medieval France against whom the Papacy, in alliance with the French monarchy, led the so-called "Albigensian Crusade" between 1208 and 1229. This will enable verification of the thesis of professor Jean-Louis Biget with regard to whether the application to the Occitan Cathars of the local southern French name of "Albigeois" (from Albi and the surrounding territory of the Albigeois) owes its origin to the ideological construction of a discourse on religious dissidence by the theocratic Church that arose from the Gregorian Reform, given that it was only used from the beginning of the anti-Cathar Crusade (1209) and only by northern writers far from Occitan lands. A consequence of this was the appearance of a generic designation for heretics in the religious, geographic and political sense, with the result that "Albigensian" would end up being applied not only to the Cathars, but also to all the Occitan nobility and populations, most of whom were Catholics, who offered resistance to the French crusades from 1209 on and the French royal troops after 1226. Given this approach, the analysis of sources not previously used historiographically for this purpose, such as the 13th-century Hispanic narrative sources, allows our perspective to be widened and the variety of denominations used to be considered more fully.

KEY WORDS

Religion, Dissidence, Thought, Language, Mentality.

CAPITALIA VERBA

Religio, Dissensio, Opinio, Lingua, Idiosincrasia.

In 1998, the French professor Jean-Louis Biget published "Les Albigeois, remarques sur une dénomination", a brilliant article that revolutionised modern historiography concerning the struggle between the Catholic Church and Catharism during the 12th and 13th centuries.¹ Biget's starting point was the preponderance in the medieval sources of the local name of *Albigensians* (from the city of Albi and its territory the Albigeois, in French "Albigeois") as a generic denomination applicable to the Provençal and Occitan heretics whom we know as *Cathars* and, by extension, to all the lands and populations of the Occitan political-cultural area.² Two facts were especially revealing. Firstly, this term only spread as a result of what we know as the "Albigensian Crusade" or "Crusade against the Albigensians" (1209-1229), the military venture organised by the Papacy, and carried out under the aegis of the French monarchy, with the aim of destroying heretics and subduing the Occitan nobility that allowed or sheltered these; and secondly, its use only appeared among authors from outside the Occitan ambit, especially *French* authors (from the regions north of the Loire) and never among those who were born or lived in the southern area, not even among the inquisitors.³

Based on this evidence, Biget considered the use of the word *Albigensians* to be result of an "arbitrary ideological construction" inserted into the "discourse of religious dissidence" drawn up in the 12th century by the theocratic Church that arose from the Gregorian Reform with the aim of consolidating its authority over all the institutions and powers in Christendom. In the case of Catharism, it was Cistercian ideologists, the leading promoters of pontifical theocracy, who, to a large degree, "invented" the heresy. Thus they recreated in an "almost paranoiac" way

1. Biget, Jean-Louis. "Les Albigeois, remarques sur une dénomination", *Inventer l'hérésie? Discours polémiques et pouvoirs avant l'Inquisition*, Monique Zerner, dir. Nice: Collection du Centre d'Études Médiévales de Nice, 1998: 219-255.

2. Jean-Louis Biget affirms that "les hérétiques méridionaux n'ont jamais pris, ni reçu, au cours du Moyen Âge, le nom de cathares" (Biget, Jean-Louis. "Les Albigeois...": 219). On this question, see: Dévic, Claude; Vaissète, Joseph. "Sur l'origine du nom d'Albigeois, donné aux hérétiques de la Province aux douzième et treizième siècles", *Histoire Générale du Languedoc*. Toulouse: Privat, 1879: VII, 33-37; Thouzellier, Christine. "Albigensians, Hérésie et Hérétiques. Vaudois, Cathares, Patarins, Albigeois." *Storia e Letteratura*, 116 (1969): 223-262; Duvernoy, Jean. "L'acceptation: 'haereticus (Iretge) = parfait cathare' en Languedoc au XIII^e siècle", *The Concept of Heresy in the Middle Ages (11th-13th C.)*. Leuven: Leuven University Press-The Hague Martinus Nijhoff, 1976: 198-210; Brenon, Anne. *La verdadera historia de los cátaros. Vida y muerte de una Iglesia ejemplar*. Barcelona: Martínez Roca, 1997: 15-16, 45, 61-65.

3. As a paradigmatic example, Biget mentions the Toulouse clergyman Guilhem de Puèglaurenc, a clear enemy of heresy, who began his famous chronicle with these words: *Incipit prologus super hystoria negocii a Francis Albiensis vulgariter appellati, quod olim constat actum esse in Provincia Narbonensi, et Albiensi, Rutenensi, Caturcensi et Agenensi diocesibus, pro tuenda fide catholica et pravitate heretica extirpanda* (Puèglaurenc, Guilhem de. *Chronica*, ed. and French trans. Jean Duvernoy. Toulouse: Le Pèlerinage, 1976: 28; Biget, Jean-Louis. "Les Albigeois...": 224 (English trans. William A. Sibly, Michael D. Sibly: *The Chronicle of William of Puylaurens: The Albigensian Crusade and Its Aftermath*. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2003). On the Albigensian Crusade in English, see Smith, Damian J. *Innocent III and the Crown of Aragon. The Limits of Papal Authority*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004; Graham-Leigh, Elaine. *The Southern French Nobility and the Albigensian Crusade*. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2005; Pegg, Mark G. *A Most Holy War: The Albigensian Crusade and the Battle of Christendom*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007; Marvin, Lawrence W. *The Occitan War. A Military and Political History of the Albigensian Crusade, 1209-1218*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008.

the imaginary idea (from the religious, territorial and political points of view) of a homogenous set of Occitan heretics prepared to destroy Christianity: the *Albigensians*. Biget does not deny the existence of the Cathars—they did exist and there were many of them—but this ideological discourse is less closely linked to the reality of the Cathars in the 12th century than the ecclesiastical and political necessity, felt by both the papal theocracy and the expansive feudal monarchies with ambitions in the county of Toulouse (Crown of Aragon, Plantagenet monarchy, Capetian monarchy), to control a rich, fragile and traditionally autonomous Occitan area. As a consequence of this ideological discourse, the mainly Catholic Occitan nobility and population, who fought against the crusades (1209-1224) and the French royal troops (1226-1229) were lumped together under the name of *Albigensians* and, thus were religious enemies susceptible to be justifiably fought, repressed and dominated in the name of the struggle against heresy.⁴

When compiling his survey of the use of the name *Albigensians*, Biget used French and Provençal authors, as well as some English and Central European writers, but left aside the Spanish sources.⁵ Bearing in mind the importance of this conflict in Hispanic medieval history, and the leading role of Spaniards in many of the key events of the Albigensian Crusade, it is interesting to investigate whether the ideological connotations of the term *Albigensians* were reflected in the narrative sources in the 13th-century Iberian kingdoms. This is the objective of the following pages.⁶

1. The heretics who did not exist

A good part of the Hispanic writers who reported the events in the south of France during the first half of the 13th century did not mention unaware of the existence of heresy. This conscious silence was because of the assistance given by the king of Aragon, Peter the Catholic, to his Occitan vassals against the troops

4. To fight the Occitan heretics and their accomplices was to take the cross *in Albigenes, contra Albigenes* or *in terra Albigenium...* Bériou, Nicole. "La prédication de croisade de Philippe le Chancelier et d'Eudes de Châteauroux en 1226", *La prédication en Pays d'Oc (XII^e-début XV^e siècle)*. Toulouse: Edouard Privat, 1997 (*Cahiers of Fanjeaux*, 32 [1997]): 85-109, especially 101; le Breton, Guillaume. «*Gesta Philippi Augusti, Francorum regis* (1220)», *Recueil des Historiens des Gaules et de la France*, Léopold Deslile, dir. Paris: Victor Palmé, 1878: XVII, 62-116, especially 92.

5. Biget used the documentation of Simon and Amaury de Montfort, the *Hystoria Albigensis* by Pierre de Vaux-de-Cernay (1218), the *Chronica* of Robert d'Auxerre (1211), the *Chronica* by Albéric de Trois-Fontaines (1241), the *Otia imperialia* by Gervase of Tilbury (1214), the *Chronica* by Guillaume de Nangis (1300), the royal documentation of the French seneschals of Beaucaire and Carcassonne (1259), the *Chronica majora* of the English benedictine Matthew Paris (1251) and the *Chronica* of the Czech Dominican, Martin of Toppau (1277), as well as the Occitan sources.

6. The initial version of this text was presented at the *II Congreso de Historia de la Iglesia en España y el mundo hispánico: "Religión, Etnia y Nación"* (Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas-Madrid, 18-20 de octubre de 2001). Internal problems in the Centre d'Études Cathares delayed the publication of the text until now. We consider that the time that has passed does not affect the validity of its contents while it has also allowed some specific references to be updated.



of the Albigensian Crusade, an initiative that ended brusquely and unexpectedly with the defeat and death of the monarch in the battle of Muret (12th September 1213).⁷ The complicity of the king of Aragon with the heretics, so clearly punished by God, meant this had to be deliberately ignored to avoid encouraging the enemies of the Crown of Aragon. The omission of all mention of the heretics, identical to that by the majority of Occitan authors,⁸ is seen in the sources throughout Hispanic historiography, although more so in those of Catalan-Aragonese origin.⁹ This is the

7. About this monarch and the battle of Muret see: Alvira, Martín. *El Jueves de Muret. 12 de Septiembre de 1213*. Barcelona: Universitat de Barcelona, 2002; Alvira, Martín. *Pedro el Católico, Rey de Aragón y Conde de Barcelona (1196-1213). Documentos, Testimonios y Memoria Histórica*. Saragossa-Toulouse: Institución Fernando el Católico-Laboratoire FRA.M.ESPA, forthcoming. Also Alvira, Martín. *Muret 1213. La batalla decisiva de la Cruzada contra los Cátaros*. Barcelona: Ariel, 2008.

8. Among the Occitan sources that adopt this posture are the second part of the *Cansó de la Crozada* (1219-1228) (*La Chanson de la Croisade Albigeoise*, ed. and French trans. Eugène Martin-Chabot. Paris: Les Belles Lettres, 1957-1961: II-III); the *Vida de Raimon de Miraval* by Uc de Sant Circ (1229-1242) (Sant Circ de, Uc. "Vida de Raimon de Miraval", *Biographies des troubadours. Textes provençaux des XIII^e et XIV^e siècles*, eds. Jean Boutière, Alexander H. Schutz. Toulouse-Paris: Edouard Privat - M. Didier, 1950: 285-287); the *Chronicle of Sainte Colombe de Bordeaux* (1176-1250) ("*Chronico Burdegalsensi Sanctae-Columbae*", *Recueil des Historiens des Gaules et de la France*, ed. Michel Jean-Joseph Brial. Paris: Palmé, 1879: XVIII, 245); the *Annals of Saint-Victor of Marseille* (539-1265) ("*Ex chronico Sancti-Victoris Massiliensis ab anno 809 ad 1563 (anni 1181-1226)*", *Recueil des Historiens des Gaules et de la France*... 1880: XIX, 238-239); the *Languedocien Chronicle* *extrait of Count Raimond VII of Toulouse's Cartulary* (1099-1275) (ed. Patrice Cabau, "Deux chroniques composées à Toulouse dans la seconde moitié du XIII^e siècle". *Mémoires de la Société Archéologique du Midi de la France*, 56 (1996): 75-120, especially 83-119); the *Cronicle of Montpellier* (814-1284) (*Cronicó de Perpinyà, segle XII: estudi filològic i lingüístic*, ed. Josep Moran. Barcelona: Publicacions de l'Abadia de Montserrat, 1998: 29-38); and the *Chronicle of Toulouse* (c. 1289) (ed. Patrice Cabau. "Deux Chroniques...": 83-119).

9. In the kingdoms of Castile and León: *Chronicon Complutense* (1226) (*Colección de Crónicas Latinas de la Reconquista*, ed. Ambrosio Huici Miranda. Valencia: 1913: I, 76); *Anales Compostelanos* (0-1248) (*España sagrada: Theatro geographico-historico de la Iglesia en España: origen, divisiones, y límites de todas sus provincias, antigüedad*, ed. Enrique Flórez de Setién Huidrobo. Madrid: Oficina de la viuda e hijo de Marin, 1799: XXIII, 318-325, especially 324); *Anales Toledanos I* (c. 1219) (*España Sagrada*...: XXIII, 382-401, especially 399); *Anales Toledanos III* (c. 1244) (*España Sagrada*...: XXIII, 410-424, especially 412); and *Chronicon Rerum Hispanicarum* (1265) (*Bibliothèque Nationale de France*, ms. lat. 5689C, f. 144-156, specially 155v; Wagner, Kay. "Debellare Albigenses". *Darstellung und Deutung des Albigenserkreuzzuges in der europäischen Geschichtsschreibung von 1209 bis 1328*, *Politik im Mittelalter*. Neuried: Ars A, 2000: Bd 4, E3. I wish to thank Dr. Wagner for the chance to consult the text of this source). In the kingdom of Navarre: *El Libro de las Generaciones* (1260-1270) (ed. Josefa Ferrandis Martínez. Valencia: Anubar, 1968: 63). In the Crown of Aragon: *Status Yspanie a principio usque nunc (1628)* (ed. Pere Quer. *La Història i Genealogies d'Espanya. Una adaptació catalana medieval de la història hispànica*. Barcelona: Publicacions de l'Abadia de Montserrat, 2006: 97-123, especially 117); *Annals de Barcelona de 1270* (*Arxiu Històric de la Ciutat de Barcelona*, ms. 1G-8, f. 20v-22r); *Crònica de Spanya* (c. 1268-1277) (ed. Pere Quer. *La Història*...: 140-163, especially 161); *Annals de Barcelona de 1278* (*Biblioteca de Catalunya*, ms. 943, f. 1-3, especially 2v); *Chronicon Ulianense* (1113-1285) (*España Sagrada*, eds. Henrique Flórez, Manuel Risco. Madrid: Imprenta de Antonio de Sancha, 1774: XXVIII, 342-344, especially 342); *Cronicó de Perpinyà* (1282-1289) (*Cronicó de Perpinyà*...: 10-16, especially 14); *Cronicó Barceloní I* or *Annals de Barcelona de 1291* (ed. Sebastià Riera. "El Cronicó Barceloní I". *Acta Historica et Archaeologica Mediaevalia*, 22 (1999-2001): II, 257-262, especially 259-262); *Chronicon Barcinonense I-II* or *Anales de Barcelona de 1311* (*España Sagrada*...: XXVIII, 331-341, especially 332, 336-338); *Chronicon Dertusense I* or *Annals de Tortosa I* (1323) (*Cronicó de Perpinyà*...: 25-27, especially 26); *Annals de Catalunya* or *Annals del món i de Espanya desde Carlomany hasta el any 1437* (*Biblioteca de El Escorial*, ms. D-III-2, f. 131r-138r, especially 131); *Crónicas de los Jueces de Teruel* (1176-1532) (eds. Fernando López Rajadel. Teruel: Instituto de Estudios Turolenses, 1994: 83); *Gesta Comitum Barcinonensium* et

case with such important sources as the *Llibre dels fets* (circa 1270) by King James the Conqueror, and the *Crònica* by Bernat Desclot (c. 1288).¹⁰

2. Manichaeans, Cathars, Arians, mad people, unbelievers, mad traitors, Sabatatz...

Other Hispanic authors did mention the Occitan heretics. One of the important terms adopted is Manichaeans. Of ancient origins, it was widely used from the 11th century by ecclesiastical writers to designate heretics with dualistic tendencies.¹¹ It appears in the title of one of the best-known anti-Cathar treatises, the *Liber contra Manicheos* by Durán de Huesca (circa 1223), an old repentant Waldensian of Occitan origin who had studied in Aragon.¹² It is also one of the terms used by the bishop of Leon and chronicler Lucas de Tuy (who died in 1249) in his important anti-heretical

Reges Aragonensium I (ed. Lucien Barrahu-Dihigo, Jaume Massó Torrents. Barcelona: Fundació Concepció Rabell i Cibils, Viuda Romaguera, 1925: II, chapter X, 3-20, especially 17-18). On this subject, see also Bautista, Francisco. "Breve historiografía: listas regias y anales en la Península Ibérica (Siglos VII-XII)". *Talia Dixit*, 4 (2009): 113-190.

10. Jaume I. *Llibre dels fets* or *Llibre dels fets del Rei En Jaume* (1244-1276), ed. Jordi Bruguera. Barcelona: Edicions 62, 1991: II, 12-15; Desclot, Bernat. *Crònica* or *Llibre del Rei en Pere* (1288), ed. Ferran Soldevila, *Les Quatre Grans Cròniques*. Barcelona: Selecta, 1971: 405-664, especially 414-415 (chapter VI). See Cingolani, Stefano M. *La memòria dels reis. Les Quatre Grans Cròniques*. Barcelona: Base, 2006: 31-74, 97-135; and Cingolani, Stefano M. *Historiografía, propaganda i comunicació al segle XIII: Bernat Desclot i les dues redaccions de la seva crònica*. Barcelona: Institut d'Estudis Catalans, 2006.

11. In the context of the Albigensian Crusade, the expression *Manichei dogma* can be found in a Latin poem written by a member of the retinue of the crusading leader Simon de Montfort, probably the French Cistercian Pierre de Vaux-de-Cernay, about the victory in the battle of Muret, *Versus de Victoria Comitum Montisfortis* (November 1215-July 1216) (Molmier, Auguste. "12 Septembre 1213. Récit en vers de la bataille de Muret". *Notices et Documents publiés pour le Société de l'Histoire de France à l'occasion du cinquantième anniversaire de sa fondation*. Paris: Société de l'Histoire de France, 1884): 129-139, especially 133 [v. 7]; Meschini, Marco. *Innocenzo III e il negotium pacis et fidei in Linguadoca tra il 1198 e il 1215*. Milan: Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore [PhD. Dissertation], 2002: 382-386 [section 2]; Alvira, Martín. *Pedro el Católico...*: II, doc n° 177.

12. *Un traité inédit du début du XIII^e siècle d'après le "Liber contra Manicheos" de Durand de Huesca*, ed. Christine Thouzellier. Leuven: Spicilegium Sacrum Lovaniense, 1961; Spanish translation in *El legado secreto de los cátaros*, ed. Francesco Zambon. Madrid: Siruela, 1997: 143-160; about Durán of Huesca, see Dondaine, Antoine. "Durand de Huesca controversiste", *X^e Congresso Internazionale di Scienze Storiche, Roma 4-11 settembre 1955*. Firenze: G. C. Sansoni, 1956: VII, 218-222; Dondaine, Antoine. "Durand de Huesca et le polémique anticathare". *Archivum Fratrum Predicatorum*, 29 (1959): 228-276; Thouzellier, Christine. "La profession trinitaire du vaudois Durand de Huesca". *Recherches de Théologie et Médiévale*, 27 (1960): 267-289 (reed. Thouzellier, Christine. *Hérésie et Hérétique: Vaudois, Cathares, Patarins, Albigeois*. Rome: Edizioni di Storia e Letteratura, 1969: 53-79); Thouzellier, Christine. "Le 'Liber Antiheresis' de Durand de Huesca et le 'Contra hereticos' d'Ermengaud de Béziers". *Revue d'Histoire Ecclesiastique*, 55 (1960): 130-141 (ed. lat. Thouzellier, Christine. *Hérésie et Hérétique...*: 39-52); Sarasa Sánchez, Esteban. "Durán de Huesca, un heterodoxo aragonés en la Edad Media", *Miscelánea de estudios en honor de D. Antonio Durán Gudiol*. Sabiñánigo: Asociación de Amigos del Serrablo, 1981: 225-238; and more recently, Grau, Sergi. "Durand de Huesca y la lucha contra el catarismo en la Corona de Aragón". *Anuario de Estudios Medievales*, 39/1 (2009): 3-25; Smith, Damian J. "Duran of Huesca: Networking to Orthodoxy", *International Religious Networks: Second Anglo-Scandinavian Colloquium on the History of Christianity (Lund, Septiembre 2005)*, forthcoming.



treatise *De altera vita* (circa 1233-1235), written to combat a dissident group from Leon traditionally identified with the Cathars (*Cum manichearum haeresis en Galliarum partibus nostris temporibus pullullaret*).¹³ Another person from Leon, the canon and intellectual Martino de León (who died in 1203), who was very close to Lucas of Tuy, also included it in his *Sermon IV*, a treatise by Christian heresies directly inspired by the *Etymologies* of Saint Isidore.¹⁴

In Durán de Huesca we find the name which is best-known and most widely-used today: *manichei id est moderni Kathari*.¹⁵ The name of *Cathars* was given to the heretics in the Rhineland in 1163 by the German canon, Eckbert of Schönau, from the patristic term (Augustinian) that designated the old novices. At first, this name was used generically in the Empire to designate heretics. From the mid 12th century, *Cathar* (Greek “pure”, “just”) began to come into use to designate the “dualist heretics”, identified in the 13th century as dangerous “new Manichaeans”. Given their current popularity, it should be remembered that this term was limited among the 12th-century anti-heretic polemicists and medieval sources in general. They were also called *false prophets*, *apostles of Satan*, *pseudo-apostles*, *piples* in Flanders, *weavers* in France, *publicans* in the north of France, *patarinos* in Italy and also *bougres* (“Bulgars”), *bogomilos* or *phundagiagitas*.¹⁶ As is known, moreover, they never called themselves “Cathars”, “pure” or “perfect”, but rather *poor of Christ*, *friends of God*, *apostles*, *Christians*, *true/good Christians*, *good men* and *good women*, *good believers*...¹⁷ In

13. Tuy, Lucas de. *De altera vita fideique controversiis adversus Albigensium errores libri III*, ed. Juan de Mariana. Ingolstadt: Andreas Angermarius - Ioannis Hertsroy, 1612: 94. About the presence of Cathars in some towns on the Santiago Trail, see Fernández Conde, Francisco Javier. “Albigenses en León y Castilla a comienzos del siglo XIII”, *León Medieval. Doce estudios. Ponencias y comunicaciones presentadas al Coloquio “El reino de León en la Edad Media”: XXXII Congreso de la Asociación Luso-Española para el Progreso de las Ciencias (León, 28 marzo- 1 abril 1977)*. León: Colegio Universitario de León, 1978: 97-114; Roth, Norman. “Jews and Albigensians in the Middle Ages: Lucas de Tuy on heretics in Leon”. *Sefarad*, 41/1 (1981): 71-93; Palacios Martín, Bonifacio. “La circulación de los cátaros por el Camino de Santiago y sus implicaciones socioculturales. Una fuente para su conocimiento”. *En la España Medieval*, 3 (1982): 219-229; Martínez Casado, Ángel. “Cátaros en León. Testimonio de Lucas de Tuy”. *Archivos Leoneses*, 74 (1983): 263-311; Fernández Conde, Francisco Javier. “El biógrafo contemporáneo de San Martino: Lucas de Tuy”, *Santo Martino de León: Ponencias del I Congreso Internacional sobre Santo Martino en el VIII centenario de su obra literaria (1185-1985)*. León: Isidoriana Editorial, 1985: 303-335; Fernández Conde, Francisco Javier. “A noyau actif d’Albigéois en Leon au commencement du XIII^e siècle ? Approche critique d’une oeuvre de Luc de Tuy écrite entre 1230-1240”. *Heresis*, 17 (1991): 35-50.

14. It designates the heretics who believed in two natures and substances (good and evil), in the emanation of the souls of divine nature and in a part of the New Testament, while they rejected the rest and the Old Testament, León, Martino de. “Sermo IV: En natale Domini”, *Patrologiae cursus completus. Patres latini*, ed. Jacques-Paul Migne. Paris: 1878-1889: 208, cols. 83-550, especially 543-550; Robles Carcedo, Laureano. “Fuentes del pensamiento teológico de Santo Martino. Estudio de los cuatro primeros ‘Sermones’”, *Santo Martino de León: Ponencias...*: 597-622, especially 619.

15. *El legado secreto de los cátaros*, ed. Francesco Zambon...: 141.

16. We follow here the reflections of Jiménez Sánchez, Pilar. *Les catharismes. Modèles dissidents du christianisme médiéval (XIe-XIIIe siècles)*. Rennes: Presses Universitaires de Rennes, 2008: 22-25, 127-141, 249, 271, and others.

17. The term *Cathar* began to appear from the publication of the *Historie et doctrine de la secte des Cathares ou Albigéois* by the Lutheran historian Charles Schmidt in 1848, and its popularisation is a phenomenon of the second half of the 20th century. About this question, see Duvernoy, Jean. *Le catharisme. La Religion*

the Hispanic sources it is an equally infrequent word. The variant *Catharoe* appears in the above-mentioned *Sermon IV* by Saint Martino of León, although, owing to the Isidorian inspiration of this text, it conserves its old sense, describing the Novatian heretics rather than the medieval Cathars.¹⁸

Arians is equally a name patristic origin.¹⁹ It appears in the aesthetic work *Planeta* (c. 1218) by Diego García de Campos, chancellor to the kings of Castile, Alfonso VIII (1154-1214) and Henry I (1214-1217), when referring in his prologue to the conflict that affected the Provençal lands because of heresy (*Quando misera nec miseranda Provincia miserabiliter arriana contra ecclesiam minus recalcitrat quam rebellat*).²⁰

The expressive terms used by Guillermo or Guilhem de Tudela, the most important Spanish writer with regard to the history of the Albigensian Crusade must also be mentioned.²¹ In the first part of the *Cansó de la Crozada* (c. 1212-1213), this Navarrese living in Occitanian lands defined the heretics as *mescrezuda jant* ("unbelievers"), *folá gent* ("mad people") or *fols traidors* ("mad traitors"), formulas that, at the end of the 13th century, the king of Castile and Leon, Alfonso X the Wise (1252-1284) included in his famous definition of the *Partidas*:

*Ereges son a manera de gente loca que se trabajan de escatimar las palabras de nuestro Señor Iesu Christo, e les dan otro entendimiento contra aquel que los Santos Padres les dieron, e que la Iglesia de Roma cree e manda guardar.*²²

Guillermo de Tudela also used the term *sabatatz* ("shoed ones"), although to designate the Waldenses, while the Cathars were called *eretges* (heretics).²³ The term

des Cathares. Toulouse: Privat, 1976: I, 297-311; and the studies in Bozóky, Edina. "Le 'livre secret' des cathares: un lien entre l'Orient et l'Occident". *Slavica Occitania*, 16 (2003).

18. In the works of Saint Augustine the heretics, who did not believe in pardon for sins and rejected remarriage were called Novatians, León, Martino de. "Sermo IV: In natale Domini".... cols. 494-509; Robles Carcedo, Laureano. "Fuentes del pensamiento teológico de Santo Martino...": 619.

19. Duvernoy, Jean. *Le catharisme. La Religion des Cathares*.... I, 301-302; Jiménez Sánchez, Pilar. *Les Catharismes*.... 264.

20. García de Campos, Diego. *Planeta*, ed. Manuel Alonso. Madrid: Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, 1943: 196.

21. His Hispanic filiation was shown by Milà i Fontanals, Manuel. "De los trovadores en España", *Obras Completas del doctor D. Manuel Milà i Fontanals*, Marcelino Menéndez Pelayo, ed. Barcelona: Librería de Alvaro Verdager, 1889: II, 360. For Guillermo de Tudela and his work, see Higounet, Charles. "À propos de Guillaume de Tudèle". *Annales du Midi*, 50 (1938): 377-379; Ghil, Eliza M. *L'Age de Parage. Essai sur le poétique et le politique en Occitanie au XIII^e siècle*. New York-Berne-Frankfurt am Main-Paris: Peter Lang, 1989: 12, 91-149, 203; Alvira, Martín. *El Jueves de Muret* 119-120; and especially, Macé, Laurent. "De Bruniquel à Lomieu: la singulière fortune de Baudouin de France et de Guillem de Tudèle au début de la croisade albigeoise". *Bulletin de la Société Archéologique et Historique de Tarn-et-Garonne*, 126 (2001): 13-23.

22. Tudèle, Guilhem de. *Cansó de la Crozada* (Tudèle, Guillaume de. *La Chanson de la croisade albigeoise*. 1. *La Chanson de Guillaume de Tudèle*, ed. and French trans. Eugène Martin-Chabot. Paris: H. Champion, 1931 (reprinted 1960), *laissez* 1-130, especially *laissez* 3, 47, 84, (English translation by Janet Shirley: Tudèle, Guillaume de. *The Song of the Cathar Wars. A History of the Albigensian Crusade*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2000); and Alfonso X El Sabio. *Las Siete Partidas*, ed. Gregorio López. Salamanca: Andrea de Portonariis, 1555: Partida VIII, tit. xxvi, "Introducción".

23. Tudèle, Guillaume de. *La Chanson de la Croisade*.... *laisse* 8, v. 15.



is especially interesting for two reasons- first, because it is uttered by Arnau Amalric, the Catalan-Occitan monk who was abbot of Cîteaux, legate of Pope Innocent III and, because of this, spiritual leader of the Crusade during its decisive early years (1209-1213);²⁴ and second, because the same term had been used earlier in the anti-heretical edicts promulgated by the kings of Aragon, Alfonso the Troubadour (1194) and Peter the Catholic (1198) against the Waldenses, *qui vulgariter dicuntur Sabatati*.²⁵

3. Heretics

Having said all that, if there is one name that appeared more than any other in the Hispanic texts related to the Cathar problem, it is *heretics*. Guillermo de Tudela cited it repeatedly in his famous historical poem (*eretges*).²⁶ A passage related to the Albigensian Crusade appears in the kingdom of Portugal in the *Cronica romana* by the canonist João de Deus (c. 1227 or c. 1242): *et hereses et hereticos destruxit cum Hugone abbate Castrense* [Arnau Amalric, abbot of the Cîteaux] *et hominibus cruce signatis cum auxilio regis Francie et comitis Montis-fortis*.²⁷

The hagiography by the Dominicans about their founder, Domingo de Guzmán, also offers innumerable examples, such as the case of the *Leyenda de Santo Domingo* by Pedro Ferrando (c. 1235-1239).²⁸

Among the chroniclers, *heretic* is also the most frequent term. In Castile and Leon, it was used by the three great Latin authors of the first half of the 13th century: Juan de Osma in his *Chronica Regum Castellae* (c. 1230- c. 1236-1239)²⁹; the archbishop of

24. For this character, see also Alvira, Martín. "Le vénérable Arnaud Amaury. Image et réalité d'un cistercien entre deux croisades". *Heresis*, 32 (2000): 3-35.

25. *Antiheretical edict by Alfonso the Troubadour, King of Aragon, against the Waldensians, the poors of Lyon and anothers heretics (Lleida, October 1194)* (Marqués-Casanova, Jaume. "Alfonso el Trovador y la Seo de Gerona", VII Congreso de Historia de la Corona de Aragón: 1-6 octubre 1962, Barcelona. Barcelona: Talleres de Viuda de Fidel Rodríguez Ferrán, 1964: II, 207-222, especially section 5: 218-219; *Alfonso II, Rey de Aragón, Conde de Barcelona y Marqués de Provenza. Documentos (1162-1196)*, ed. Ana Isabel Sánchez Casabón. Saragossa: Institución "Fernando el Católico", 1995: 797-798 [doc. 621]; and Baraut, Cebrià. "Els inicis de la inquisició a Catalunya i les seves actuacions al bisbat d'Urgell (segles XII-XIII)". *Urgellia*, 13 (1996-97): 407-438, especially 419-420 [doc. 1]; and *Antiheretical edict by Peter the Catholic, King of Aragon, against the Waldenses and anothers heretics (Girona, February 1194)* (Cebrià Baraut, Cebrià. "Els inicis de la inquisició a Catalunya...": 420-422 [doc. 2]; Alvira, Martín. *Pedro el Católico...: I*, doc. n° 128). Another name which is as interesting as it is rare is *Begginos*, mentioned in the *Annals of Cologne* (*Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Scriptores*, Georg Heinrich Petz, ed. Hannover: Impensis Bibliopoli Aulici Hahniani, 1861: XVII, 729-847, especially 827).

26. Tudèle, Guillaume de. *La Chanson de la Croisade ...: laisse 3* (among other mentions).

27. Deus, João de. "Cronica romana", *Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Scriptores*. Hannover: Impensis Bibliopolii Hahniani, 1903: XXXI, 304-324, especially 324.

28. Ferrando, Pedro. "Leyenda de Santo Domingo", *Santo Domingo de Guzmán visto por sus contemporáneos*, eds. Miguel Gelabert, José María Milagro, José María de Garganta. Madrid: Católica, 1966: 293-332.

29. *Chronica Regum Castellae* or *Crónica Latina de los Reyes de Castilla*, ed. and trans. Luis Charlo Brea. Cádiz: Universidad de Cádiz, 1984: 73-75; *Chronica hispana saeculi XIII*, eds. Luis Charlo Brea, Juan Antonio Estévez Sola, Rocío Carande Herrero. Turnhout: Brepols, 1997: 7-118, especially 66-67.

Toledo, Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada in his *Historia de Rebus Hispaniae* (1243-1247);³⁰ and the above-mentioned Lucas de Tuy in his *Chronicon mundi* (c. 1230-1236).³¹ The latter also used this term in his hagiographic work, entitled *Liber Miraculorum Sancti Isidori* (which included a *Vita Sancti Martini Legionensis*) (c. 1221-1224 and after 1236)³², and, what is much more significant, in his anti-heretic treatise *De altera vita*.³³ In this sense, two pieces of data should be remembered: first, in relation to the *De altera vita*, it was Father John of Mariana who added the phrase *fideique controversiis adversus Albigensium errores libri III* to the original title that appears in the edition printed in 1612,³⁴ and second, regarding Lucas de Tuy, all of whose works, as Patrick Henriët affirms, were part of a same project, that is, the defence of the dogma and the struggle against heresy.³⁵ Given his purpose the absence of the terms *Cathar* and *Albigensian* in the works by "El Tudense" is made all the more interesting.

In the second half of the 13th century, king Alfonso X the Wise mentioned in his unfinished *Estoria de Espanna* (c. 1270-1289)

los hereges que eran muchos en... [el] arzobispado de Narbona and los hereges que yvan contra los cristianos con envidia de los bienes de Jhesu Cristo et de la su ley, tantos en Nar-

30. Jiménez de la Rada, Rodrigo. *Historia de rebus Hispaniae sive Historia Gothica*, ed. Juan Fernández Valverde. Turnhout: Brepols, 1987: book VI, chapter IIII; book VIII, chapter II.

31. The version in old Castilian states: [Fernando III, king of Castile and León] *encendido con fuego de la verdad catholica, [en tanto] noblemente rigio el reyno a ssí subjecto, que los enemigos de la fee christiana perseguía con todas [sus] fuerças, e cualesquiera hereges que hallaua, quemaua con fuego, y el fuego y las brasas y la llama aparejaua para los quemar* (Tuy, Lucas de. *Crónica de España*, ed. Julio Puyol. Madrid: Real Academia de la Historia, 1926: book IV, 418 [chapter LXXXV]).

32. Referring to Cathars or lay non-believers, Lucas de Tuy, *Vita Sancti Martini Legionensis* (included at the end of the *Liber Miraculorum Sancti Isidori*): 208, cols. 9-24, especially chap. VII, col. 14; Mitre Fernández, Emilio. "La cultura antiherética en tiempos de la crisis cátara. De Martín de León a Alfonso X", *Le Catharisme: nouvelles recherches, nouvelles perspectives. Colloque International en hommage à Jean Duvernoy* (Carcassonne, Centre d'Études Cathares René Nelli, 20-22 août 1998), unpublished; Viñayo González, Antonio. "Santo Martino de León y su noticia histórica: biografía, santidad, culto", *Santo Martino de León: Ponencias...*: 337-360, especially 347. My thanks to Patrick Henriët for his valuable guidance in relation to these works.

33. See the essential studies about Lucas de Tuy and his work in: Henriët, Patrick, coord. "Luc de Tuy, Chroniqueur, hagiographe, théologien". *Cahiers de linguistique hispanique médiévale*, 24 (2001): 199-309; and *Lucae Tudensis Chronicon mundi*, ed. Emma Falque. Turnhout: Brepols, 2003: "Introducción".

34. "...sólo en el trasfondo [de *De altera vita*], como supremo analogado del error, aparecen los albigenses, de quienes [Lucas de Tuy] resalta frecuentemente sus doctrinas dualistas o maniqueas (nunca los llama albigenses ni cátaros, ni les da el nombre de cristianos)" (Martínez Casado, Ángel. "Cátaros en León. Testimonio de Lucas de Tuy". *Archivos Leoneses: revista de estudios y documentación de los Reinos Hispano-Occidentales*, 74 (1983): 272, 274). On this question, see also: Menéndez Pelayo, Marcelino. *Historia de los heterodoxos españoles*, ed. Enrique Sánchez Reyes. Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Católicos, 1956 (ed. 1882 and 1910): I, book III, chapter II, point V: 528-536; Mitre Fernández, Emilio. "La cultura antiherética en tiempos de la crisis cátara", *Iglesia y religiosidad en España: historia y archivos. Actas de las V Jornadas de Castilla-La Mancha sobre investigación en archivos* (Guadalajara, 8-11 mayo 2001). Guadalajara: Confederación de Asociaciones de Archiveros, Bibliotecarios, Museólogos y Documentalistas ANABAD Castilla-La Mancha-Asociación de Amigos del Archivo Histórico Provincial de Guadalajara, 2002: II, 11-13 (doc. n.º 11).

35. Henriët, Patrick. "'Sanctissima patria'. Point et thèmes communs aux trois œuvres de Lucas de Tuy". *Cahiers de linguistique hispanique médiévale*, 24 (2001): 249-277, especially 270.



*bona et en Beders et en Carcaxona que dalli adelant nunca fue ninguno osado de tener razon de la creencia de la eregia.*³⁶

The same name was used taken up by the post-Alfonsine chroniclers at the end of the 13th century and beginning of the 14th, both in Castile, Leon and Portugal.³⁷

In the Crown of Aragon, in contrast, the official chronicles took a long time to admit the existence of the Occitan *eretges*. This is clear proof of the serious consequences of the disaster at Muret. The first mentions, taken from the "History of Spain" by Archbishop Rodrigo de Toledo, are in versions II and III of the *Gesta Comitum Barcinonensium et Reges Aragonensium*, the official history of the Catalan-Aragonese monarchy written in the monastery of Santa Maria de Ripoll (c. 1268-1269 and c. 1303-1314).³⁸ We have, however, two contemporary sources that do mention what was happening on the other side of the Pyrenees. One is the *Chronicon Rotense*, whose penultimate chapter gives detailed information about the operations of the Albigensian Crusade between 1209 and 1211. Its author, a canon of San Vicente de Roda, openly recognised the existence of *gentem hereticorum et coadiutores eorum*, but still censored the violence of the crusades. The chronicle allows us to perceive how the Crown of Aragon regarded the consequences of the Occitan-Cathar conflict:

ANNO M^oCC^oVIII^o. Cruciferi ex precepto domini Pape ad destruendam gentem hereticorum et coadiutores eorum, venerunt in Bederres et in Carcassona et ceperunt eas cum omnibus terminis earum et interfecerunt vicecomitem dominum illius predicte terre, et dedit cruciferis dominus Papa ducem et principem abbatem Cistellentium, et ceperunt Benerba et Termens, et Pamias, et Albi, et Caparetum, et Zabaurum, et obsederunt Tolosam, et interfecerunt in omnibus predictis civitatibus, et castellis, et villis et terris amplius quam centum milia virorum et mulierum cum parvulis suis, et pregnantes mulieres interficiebant, et quosdam

36. "... there were many heretics in... [the] archbishopric of Narbonne and the heretics that went against the Christians with envy of the goods of Jesus Christ and that of his law, both in Narbonne and in Béziers and in Carcassonne that from then on never dared to be right about the belief in heresy" (Alfonso X El Sabio. *Primera Crónica General de España. Estoria de España*, ed. Ramon Menéndez Pidal, Diego Catalán. Madrid: 1977: 479, 690). About this theme, see the many references in: Mitre Fernández, Emilio. "Hérésie et culture dirigeante dans la Castille de la fin du XIII^e siècle. Le modèle de Alphonso X". *Hérésis*, 9 (1987): 33-47; and, especially, Mitre Fernández, Emilio. "La cultura antiherética en tiempos de la crisis cátara"...: 4-11. Among the generic expressions from the 13th century we can signal that of *ierro de eresia*, extracted from Berceo, Gonzalo de. *Los Milagros de Nuestra Señora*. Madrid: Alba, 1998: 37.

37. *Crónica de Veinte Reyes* (fin. s. XIII-princ. s. XIV), ed. César Hernández Alonso et alii. Burgos: Ayuntamiento de Burgos, 1991: 156-157 (book VII, chapter 13); and in the *Crónica Geral de Espanha de 1344 que ordenó el conde barcelonés Don Pedro Alfonso (1317-1320)*, ed. Luis F. Lindley Cintra. Lisbon: 1951-1990: III, 266-268 (chapters CDXXXV-CDXXXVI).

38. *Gesta Comitum Barcinonensium et Reges Aragonensium II* (1268-1269), *Monuments d'Història de la Corona d'Aragó* (MHCA). 1: *Gestes dels Comtes de Barcelona i Reis d'Aragó*, ed. Stefano Maria Cingolani. Valencia: Universitat de València, 2008: 125-131 (chapter XXII); and *Gesta Comitum Barcinonensium et Reges Aragonensium III* (1303-1314), ed. Lucien Barrahu-Dihigo, Jaume Massó Torrents. Barcelona: Fundació Concepció Rabell i Cíbils, vidua Romaguera, 1925: 21-116, especially 53-54, 56-57. About these sources, see Cingolani, Stefano M. *La memòria...*: 17-30, 77-78.

*excoriabant, et nullus a manibus eorum evadere poterat, et multa alia that ab eis facta sunt, non possunt enumerari.*³⁹

The second was the *Chronicon Dertusense II* or Annals of Tortosa (1097-1210), an analytical work initiated in Ripoll, taken around 1115 to the monastery of Saint John near Ripoll (nowadays Sant Joan de les Abadesses) and finished in 1176 in the city of Tortosa, probably by Ponç de Mulnells, abbot of Saint John and bishop of Tortosa between 1165 and 1193. It offers a brief notice of the conquests of Béziers and Carcassonne (1209) that clearly admits the massive presence of heretics beyond the Pyrenees, which places the author in the clearly anti-heretical position that was shared by all the Spanish Church:

*Era M.CC.XL.VII. anno M.CC.VIII. gens catholica venit contra haereticos in partibus Biteris et Carcassonae, et in mense julio capta est Biteris, in qua interfecti sunt plusquam. XXV. milia haereticorum; continuo ab eisdem mense augusto capta est Carcassona et quamplurima oppida haereticorum.*⁴⁰

4. Blasphemers

This is an infrequent, but interesting term. It should be kept in mind because the author who first used it archbishop Rodrigo of Toledo, who must be considered the true creator of the "Hispanic historical memory" of the Albigensian Crusade.⁴¹ His version of the origins of the *negotium pacis et fidei* (1208-1209) state the following:

*Hic [abbot and legate Arnau Amalric] pauco ante emulatione legis catholice prouocatus contra quosdam, qui in Narbonense et uicinis prouinciis blasphemare nomen Domini et Ecclesiam ore nephario presumpserunt, corda fidelium excitaui ut signo crucis contra hereticorum uersucias armarentur. Et sic factum set per Dei gratiam, quod ubi contempta predicatio non profecit, falce crucis putatis heresibus fides catholica die in diem feliciter coalescit; et destructis Biterris et Carcasona blasphemantium sanguis flama uorace et ultrici gladio est consumptus era MCCXLVI.*⁴²

39. *Chronicon Rotense*, Archiu Capítular de Lleida, Fons de Roda, Codex nº 11, *Breviario de la Iglesia de Roda*, f. 202v-203v, especially 203v. On this question, see Alvira, Martín. "La Couronne d'Aragon, entre hérétiques et croisés: La Croisade albigeoise (1209-1211) selon le 'Chronicon Rotense'". *Heresis*, 38, 2003: 71-87.

40. *Chronicon Dertusense II* or *Annals of Tortosa*, Arxiu Capítular de Tortosa, Cartulari 8, f. 157v-159v. On these sources, see Salrach, Josep Maria. "Contribució dels monjos de Ripoll als orígens de la historiografia catalana; els primers crònicons", *Art i Cultura als monestirs del Ripollès. Santa Maria de Ripoll-Sant Joan de les Abadesses-Sant Pere de Camprodon*. Ponències de la 1^a. Setmana de Estudis (Sessions del 16 al 18 de setembre de 1992). Barcelona: Associació Amics dels Monestirs del Ripollès-Publicacions de l'Abadia de Montserrat, 1995: 28-32.

41. Alvira, Martín. "La Cruzada Albigense y la intervención de la Corona de Aragón en Occitania. El recuerdo de las crónicas hispánicas del siglo XIII". *Hispania*, 60/3, 206 (2000): 947-976, especially 962-968.

42. Jiménez de Roda, Rodrigo. *Historia de Rebus Hispaniae...*: book VIII, chapter II. About this author and his chronicle, see the studies in Martín, George, coord. "Rodríguez Jiménez de Rada (Castille, première



There are no doubts about the position adopted here in the face of the heresy. However, Rodrigo de Toledo did not interpret the political consequences of the conflict in the same way. In a previous chapter, he explained the death of King Peter, the Catholic, in Muret with a formula that would be assumed almost systematically by the later official Hispanic historiography:

*Nec rex Petrus, cum esset plene catholicus, in fauorem venerat blasphemorum, set, ut diximus, affinitatis debito prouocatus.*⁴³

5. Albigensians

Having reached this point, it is important to bear in mind that we have still made no reference to the term *Albigenses*. In truth, we have only found this term in the above-cited *Chronica Regum Castellae*. This original chronicle tale is attributed to Juan, chancellor of King Fernando III of Castile (1217-1252), who was also abbot of Santa María la Mayor in Valladolid (1219-1231), then bishop of Burgos and finally bishop of Osma (who died in 1246).⁴⁴ His version of the early years of the Albigensian Crusade (1209-1213) is so original, interesting and important that it is worth repeating it in full:

Papa siquidem Romanus Innocencius tercius dederat remissionem generalem peccatorum omnibus illis qui venirent super Albigenses et alios hereticos qui erant in partibus illis. Pululaverant namque hereses diverse, facies quidem habentes diversas et caudas colligatas, et multiplicabantur cotidie adeo quod periculosum erat universali ecclesie amplius talia dissimulare. Catholici ergo diversis partibus et precipue of regno Francie venientes, fere totam terram illam in modico tempore Christi fidei subiugaverunt, castra multa et civitates munitissimas, quasi inexpugnabiles, in momento temporis subvertentes, hereticos ipsos diversis penis affligentes et variis mortibus interimentes. Operabatur siquidem manifeste et miraculose virtus Domini nostri Iesu Christi, qui est rex regum et dominus dominancium, per ministerium illustrissimi et fidelissimi comitis Simonis Montis Fortis, qui velud alter ludas Macabeus, legem Dei zelans, viriliter et potenter bella Domini preliabatur.

moitié du XIII^e siècle): Histoire, historiographie". *Cahiers de linguistique hispanique médiévale*, 26 (2003): 11-307.

43. In this same chapter (book VI, chapter III) he used the terms *heretic* and *blasphemer* together: *Demum cum venerabilis Arnaldus Narbonensis antistes contra hereticos, qui en prouincia Narbonensi nomen Domini blasphemabant, de Galliis crucis signatorum multitudinem aduocasset, aduenit Petrus rex Aragonum in auxilium comitis Tolosani*. Rodrigo de Toledo. *Historia de Rebus Hispaniae*...: book VI, chapter III.

44. On Juan de Osma and his chronicle, see the introductions by Charlo Brea and its editions (Osma, Juan de. *Crónica Latina de los Reyes de Castilla*, ed. and Spanish trans. Luis Charlo Brea. Cádiz: Servicio de Publicaciones de la Universidad de Cádiz, 1984; Osma, Juan de. *Chronica Hispana Saeculi XIII*, ed. Luis Charlo Brea. Cádiz: Servicio de Publicaciones de la Universidad de Cádiz, 1997) and its another Spanish translation (Osma, Juan de. *Chronica latina Regum Castellae*, ed. Luis Charlo Brea. Madrid: Akal, 1999), as well as the recent studies in Martín, George, coord. "Chronica Regum Castellae". *e-Spania. Revue électronique d'études hispaniques médiévales*. December 2006. Université Paris-Sorbonne Paris IV. 22th of December 2006 <<http://e-spania.revues.org/index31.html>>.

Predictum comitem Symonem Montis Fortis, cum quo erant fere quingenti milites, obsedit rex Aragonum memoratus et comes Tolosanus et alii comites cum eis et bar[for]nes et nobiles terre et populi multi in quodam castro, fiduciam habentes firmam quod possent ipsum capere. Erat autem comes vir strenuus et bellicosus et cor eius habens fiduciam firmam in Domino Iesu Christo, pro quo cotidie laborabat. Videns igitur periculum sibi et suis imminere, in virtute Domini Iesu Christi exeuntes of castro obsesso irruerunt in castra et eos per virtutem Crucis verterunt in fugam, et ipsum regem Aragonum cum multis militibus interfecerunt. Felix fuisset rex ille, si vitam finisset statim post nobile triumphum belli commissi in Navas of Tolosa contra regem Marroquitanum.⁴⁵

We thus finally have an interpretation that fits the “discourse of religious dissidence” analysed by Jean-Louis Biget. However, it is, as far as we know, the only one from the whole of the 13th century.

6. The denomination *Albigensians* as an expression of an ideological discourse

Why is there this almost total absence of the term *Albigensians* in the 13th-century Hispanic sources? What is behind the exceptionality of the *Chronica Regum Castellae*.

There are at least two important reasons that could answer these questions. The first is related to the argument that Biget used to justify the absence of the name *Albigensians* in the works by Occitan authors or those who wrote their works in Occitan lands: this was a name for the local inhabitants that could not be converted into a term for the heretics by those who knew “the realities of the Midi” well.⁴⁶ In the Iberian case, the geographic, historical and cultural proximity of the Hispanic and Occitan societies during these centuries allows a high enough degree of knowledge about the Occitan reality to be attributed to the peninsular authors (at least the majority and the most important of them) so that that the same argumentation is also valid for them.⁴⁷ The second reason is ideological-political, and has a direct relation with the posture adopted by the Hispanic historiography in the face of the Albigensian Crusade. Most Hispanic authors reduced a twenty-year war, with decisive consequences for the historical evolution of all of southern Europe, to the battle of Muret and, in the most extreme cases, to the great campaign of 1209 that ended with the conquest of Béziers and Carcassonne. Almost all hid the existence of

45. Osma, Juan de. *Chronica Hispana Saeculi XIII...* 1997: 66-67 (chapter 27).

46. Biget, Jean-Louis. “Les Albigeois...”: 224 (author’s translation).

47. Examples are the references to the *Gallia Gothica* by Alfonso X, The Wise in his *General Estoria* (Alfonso X el Sabio. *Prosa histórica*, ed. Benito Brancaforte. Madrid: Cátedra, 1990: 95 [chapter 558]) or, later, by Don Juan Manuel in his: Manuel, Don Juan. *Crónica abreviada* (Juan Manuel, infante de Castilla. *Obras Completas de Don Juan Manuel*, ed. José Manuel Blecua. Madrid: Gredos, 1982-1983: II, 790 [chapter CCXXX]). On this subject, see Alvira, Martín. “Le Jeudi de Muret: Aspects idéologiques et mentaux de la bataille de 1213”, ‘La Croisade albigeoise’. *Colloque de Carcassonne* (Centre d’Études Cathares, Carcassonne - octobre 2002). Balma: CEC, 2004: 197-207.



heresy. And more than a few (and not minor) writers justified, one way or another, the military intervention that had led the king of Aragon to his death among the heretics.⁴⁸

Were there any 13th-century Hispanic authors who broke with this interpretative scheme? In fact, there was one—precisely the Castilian chancellor and bishop who wrote the *Chronica Regum Castellae*. His clear vision of the Occitan-Cathar conflict, his opposition to the intervention of the king of Aragon in 1213, his eulogies to the figure of Simon de Montfort, military leader of the crusades, and the “hagiographic” form of these eulogies (the identification with *alter Iudas Macabeus* is very significant) are all exceptional in the Hispanic interpretation of the Albigensian Crusade⁴⁹. What is more important, these are elements that are part of the ideological discourse maintained by the pro-crusade party of Montfort and the Franco-Occitan prelates through their spokesman, the French Cistercian Pierre des Vaux-de-Cernay, author of the *Hystoria Albigensis* (c. 1213-1218), a work considered the “official history” of the Crusade.⁵⁰ It was this same discourse, in short, that converted the name *Albigensians* into the global denomination applied to the Occitan heretics and their accomplices.

Thus, it could be proposed that it was the identification with the “Cistercian discourse of dissidence” that led the author of the *Chronica Regum Castellae* to use the denomination *Albigensians*. Identification with the ideas would logically have led to identification with the expressions. And it is just the same argument switched round, the non-identification with the ideological discourse of the outright defenders of the Albigensian Crusade, which could explain, to a large extent, the absence of this denomination in the other 13th-century Hispanic authors. The fact that the name *Albigensians* did not even appear among those, such as the bishop Lucas de Tuy, whose main worry was the danger of the heresy, gives even more consistency to Biget’s thesis: that is, to the existence of an ideological discourse of dissidence, closely linked to the Cistercian world that sustained the Albigensian Crusade and differentiated from the natural opposition to heresy that all the ecclesiastical writers of the time shared.

48. Analysis in Alvira, Martín. “La Cruzada Albigense”...: 947-976; Alvira, Martín. *El Jueves de Muret...*: 370-407; and Alvira, Martín. *Muret 1213...*: 210-220.

49. His story of the last years of the Crusade (1226-1229) is exceptional in 13th-century peninsular historiography. Osma, Juan de. *Crónica Latina de los Reyes de Castilla*, ed. Luis Charlo Brea...1984: 73-75.

50. Vaux-de-Cernay, Pierre des. *Hystoria Albigensis*, ed. Pascal Guébin, Ernest Lyon. Paris: H. Champion, 1926-1930; Vaux-de-Cernay, Pierre des. *Hystoria Albigensis*, eds. and French trans. Paul Guébin, Henri Maisonneuve. Paris: J. Vrin, 1951 (English trans. William A. Sibly, Michael D. Sibly: The History of the Albigensian Crusade. Woodbridge-Rochester: Boydell Press, 1998). X. Pierre, monk in the Cistercian abbey of Vaux-de-Cernay, was Guy des Vaux-de-Cernay’s nephew, who was abbot of this monastery (1184-1212), relative of count Simon de Montfort and later bishop of Carcassonne (1212). About this author and his work, see the introductions to the Latin and French editions; Dossat, Yves. “La Croisade vue par les chroniqueurs”. *Cahiers de Fanjeaux*, 4 (1969): 221-259, especially 221-233; Martel, Philippe. “Les cathares et leur historiens”, *Les cathares en Occitanie*. Paris: Fayard, 1982: 409-483, especially 413-415; Alvira, Martín. *El Jueves de Muret...*: 121-123; Meschini, Marco. “Innocenzo III e il *negotium pacis* et fidei in Linguadoca tra il 1198 e il 1215”. *Atti della Accademia Nazionale dei Lincei*, 20/2 (2007): 365-906, especially 730-761.

From the beginning of the 13th century, reasons of political and ideological order, as well as the geographical-historical-cultural proximity already mentioned, explain the absence of the name *Albigensians* in works from the Crown of Aragon. In the western kingdoms, in contrast, it could be due to a question of the historiographical tradition more than one of ideological identification. The inheritance of Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, maximum *auctoritas* of the 13th century in historical material, would have played a decisive role here.⁵¹ Thus, while in other regions of southern Europe the dominant anti-heretical discourse was fully assumed -for example in the *Liber de Temporibus et Aetatibus* by Alberto Milioli di Reggio (c. 1286) or in the *Chronica* by Salimbene de Adam (c. 1287)⁵², the members of the historiographical workshop of Alfonso X the Wise continued to use the expression *hereses* inherited from Archbishop Rodrigo of Toledo. As the *Chronica Regum Castellae* was not used by any compiler or chronicler after its writing, the Hispanic version of the "ideological discourse of religious dissidence" was relegated from the official history of the 13th century... and, with it, also the use of the word *Albigensians*.

51. Rodrigo de Toledo's work is of enormous historical importance. It could be said that "the Toledan text constitutes the main base for the historical tale" elaborated in Castile and Leon from the mid 13th century, Fernández Ordóñez, Isabel. "Variación en el modelo historiográfico alfonsí en el siglo XIII. Las versiones de la *Estoria de España*", *La historia alfonsí: el modelo y sus destinos (siglos XIII-XV)*, George Martin, coord. Madrid: Casa Velázquez, 2000: 41-74, especially 47. This influence of Rodrigo de Toledo is, in many cases, projected into the 15th century. As Jean-Pierre Jardin affirms, "It could be said without exaggerating that Jiménez de Rada is the director of conscience for the authors of 15th-century summaries. He was the highest authority they knew" (Jardin, Jean Pierre. "El modelo alfonsí ante la revolución trastámara. Los sumarios de crónicas generales del siglo XV", *La historia alfonsí...*: 141-156, especially 145; Jardin, Jean-Pierre. "Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada comme "auctoritas": les sommes de chroniques générales du XV^e siècle". *Cahiers d'études hispaniques médiévales*, 26 (2003): 295-307). For the influence of Catalan-Aragonese historiography, see Coll i Alentorn, Miquel. "Roderic Ximènez de Rada i la nostra historiografia", *Historiografia*. Barcelona: Curial Edicions Catalanes-Publicacions de l'Abadia de Montserrat, 1991: 114-117; Cingolani, Stefano M. *La memòria...*: 28-30, 35, 77-80; and Quer, Pere. *La Història...* In the Navarrese chronicles, Orcástegui, Carmen. "La memoria histórica de Navarra a fines de la Edad Media: la historiografía nacional". *Príncipe de Viana*, 2-3 (1986): 596-599; and in the Portuguese chronicles, Barcelos, Pedro Afonso, Conde de. *Crónica Geral de Espanha de 1344*, ed. Luís Felipe Lindley Cintra. Lisboa: Academia Portuguesa da História, 1951-1990; and Barcelos, Pedro Afonso, Conde de. *Edición crítica del texto español de la Crónica de 1344*, eds. Diego Catalán, María Soledad de Andrés. Madrid: Gredos, 1970.

52. ...de combustione hereticorum, quam fieri fecit Francie in terra Albigensium... (Milioli Di Reggio, Alberto. "Liber de Temporibus et Aetatibus", *Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Scriptores*. Hannover: Impensis Bibliopolii Hahniani, 1903: XXXI, 353-572, especially 362 (chapter CXCVI), 453 (chapter CLXXXVI)); and... ut terram Albigensium... (Salimbene Di Adamo or Da Parma. "Chronica", *Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Scriptores*. Hannover: Impensis Bibliopolii Hahniani, 1905-1913: XXXII, 1-95, especially 22).

