

## **NOTAS Y RESEÑAS**

---

RESEÑAS

**SÓNIA FROTA & PILAR PRIETO (EDS) (2015): *Intonation in Romance*, Oxford, Oxford University Press.**

It would be hard to find another linguistic sub-discipline that has developed during the last few decades with the same speed and depth as prosody, especially intonation. The collective work *Intonation in Romance*, edited by Sónia Frota and Pilar Prieto and with contributions from more than forty researchers, is one product of that burst of activity, offering a detailed description of the prosodic and intonational properties of nine Romance languages, namely Catalan, French, Friulian, Italian, Occitan, Portuguese, Romanian, Sardinian, and Spanish, and their dialects. A carefully conceived and crafted compilation with a clear goal and transparent methodology, this book constitutes an important contribution to the study of intonational variation across as well as within languages. For the transcription of the intonation and prosodic structure of spoken utterances, the work applies to all the languages it examines the Tones and Break Indices (ToBI) labelling system, grounded in the Autosegmental Metrical (AM) model of intonational phonology. It should be noted that whereas some of the Romance languages discussed in this book (e.g., Catalan, Italian, and Spanish) already come with a long tradition of analysis from within the AM model and ToBI framework, there are varieties of these languages whose intonational aspects have been either studied very little, and from other theoretical perspectives, or examined outside any theoretical framework for phonological modelling. Hence, another important contribution of this book consists in the fact that it presents first proposals for a ToBI transcription system for French, Portuguese, Romanian, and their dialects. Not less importantly, the reader is introduced to the prosodic properties of three further –and according to several sources endangered– languages in the Romance family: Friulian, spoken in the north-eastern part of Italy, Occitan, spoken mainly in the south of France but also in some border areas of Italy and Spain, and Sardinian, spoken across most of Sardinia. In this respect, the book is unique in offering a cross-linguistic and cross-dialectal analysis within one of Europe's major language families, discussing not only major national languages but also minority languages.

The book has eleven chapters in total, plus *References* and *Index*. Each chapter (except the first and last) focuses on one language and covers the following topics in this order: (i) the geographic distribution of the language and its dialects; (ii) the

basic features of its prosody, such as rhythm, stress, and prosodic phrasing; (iii) previous research on its intonation and prosody, (iv) a description of the methodology used in each chapter; (v) the intonational contours of several types of sentences such as statements, yes-no questions, wh-questions, imperatives, and vocatives, and a discussion of their relationship with different pragmatic intentions (doubt, confirmation, obviousness, etc.); and (vi) a summary of the intonation inventory of the given language, underlining diatopic variation as well as similarities and differences with other Romance languages. This common structuring of chapters greatly facilitates comparison across languages. In addition, audio recordings of all the examples offered in the text are accessible at the Oxford University Press website.

In fact, the common structuring of chapters is partly the fruit of having applied a common methodology, since the intonational data for all nine languages were elicited by means of a questionnaire based on the so-called *Discourse Completion Task*, an inductive method frequently used in the areas of second language acquisition, pragmatics, and sociolinguistics as well as prosody. Though this methodology was universally applied here, supplementary techniques were also used in several cases, such as reading tasks and map tasks (see Chapters 7 and 10) or fable retelling (see Chapter 6).

In the Introduction (Chapter 1), the editors present the structure of the book and outline main objectives, emphasizing how they provide *transparency in the prosodic notation by using phonological labels in comparable ways across languages* (p. 3). Though that is clearly their intention, however, the use of these labels is occasionally misleading. To give an example, in Figure 2.11 (p. 27) the pitch accent on the word *m'has* is labelled as L\*+H, which is very similar to the pitch accent on the word *ora* in Figure 8.17 (p. 303), where the label L\* is applied. In both cases, we observe a pitch accent that is phonetically realized as a low valley on the accented syllable, followed by a rise on the post-tonic syllable. In the latter case, it is not clear whether the L\* is labelled phonetically or phonologically. Though such puzzling cases are rather exceptional, an overview in the *Introduction* or *Appendix* of all labels for pitch accents and boundary tones, together with their phonetic characteristics, might have been very useful for orientation and consultation purposes.

The main body of the book starts with a discussion of Catalan intonation in Chapter 2 by Pilar Prieto, Joan Borràs-Comes, Teresa Cabré, Verònica Crespo-Sendra, Ignasi Mascaró, Paolo Roseano, Rafèu Sichel-Bazin, and Maria del Mar Vanrell. This work, which summarises and builds on two important previous

projects (*Cat\_ToBI* by Aguilar et al. 2009–2011 and the *Interactive Atlas of Catalan Intonation* by Prieto & Cabré 2007–2012), is based on data from 70 different localities. These represent the main dialectal areas of Catalan, namely Northern, Central, Northwestern, Valencian, Balearic, and Alguerese (spoken in Sardinia). In spite of the fact that only two persons per location were interviewed (with exception of the Alguerese dialect), both the amount of data collected and the intonational variation across dialects that they reveal are impressive. The main results show that Catalan displays a very «rich» intonation inventory in comparison with other languages like French or Sardinian. The chapter ends with an appendix consisting of dialect maps (pp. 50–61), which were created using the Voronoi tessellation technique and are organised according to twelve different sentence types (e.g., broad-focus statements, information-seeking yes-no questions, and echo wh-questions). These illustrations give us an excellent overview of dialectal variation found in the nuclear configurations.

The main objective of Chapter 3, written by Elisabeth Delais-Roussarie, Brechtje Post, Mathieu Avanzi, Carolin Buthke, Albert Di Cristo, Ingo Feldhausen, Sun-Ah Jun, Philippe Martin, Trudel Meisenburg, Annie Rialland, Rafèu Sichel-Bazin, and Hi-Yon Yoo, is to develop a ToBI system for French. The study examines nine dialectal varieties of French spoken in Romance but also in non-Romance areas within Europe. The main difference between French (and Occitan as spoken in France) and the rest of the Romance languages is the presence of the Accentual Phrase, defined as a prosodic phrase which is *bounded by a final accent* and which *corresponds minimally to a lexical word and to all the function words that this word governs* (p. 67). One explanation for this is that French lacks lexical stress in comparison with other Romance languages. Notable too is its relatively small intonation inventory. Unlike Catalan, for instance, which displays fifteen different nuclear configurations (pp. 45–46) and has complex boundary tones such as LH, HL, and even LHL, French has just six types of nuclear configuration and only two monotonal edge tones (L and H). To explain the intonational differences between the French varieties studied here, the authors suggest that they might be due to different phonetic implementations or to additional prosodic phenomena such as lengthening. They caution, however, that such hypotheses need to be confirmed in further research.

Chapter 4, by Paolo Roseano, Maria del Mar Vanrell, and Pilar Prieto, is devoted to Friulian. As mentioned above, this contribution attempts to give the first description of the intonation of nine Friulian dialects from within the ToBI framework. Interestingly, this Romance language displays one of the most limited intonational inventories of all the languages in this volume. The authors

convincingly show that some «missing» intonation patterns are compensated for by morpho-syntactic elements and/or modal particles. Moreover, they suggest that Friulian should be seen as a kind of «bridge» language between Romance, Germanic, and (South-)Slavic languages since it exhibits some prosodic as well as non-prosodic properties that are characteristic of neighbouring non-Romance languages, a point that could be explored more deeply in future research. The chapter ends with a summary of the most frequently used modal particles and tags in Friulian (23 in total), with their sentence position and function. It might be noted that interlinear glosses as they are used here would also have been very helpful in other chapters for readers unfamiliar with Romance languages.

In Chapter 5, Barbara Gili Fivela, Cinzia Avesani, Marco Barone, Giuliano Bocci, Claudia Crocco, Mariapaola D'Imperio, Rosa Giordano, Giovanna Marotta, Michelina Savino, and Patrizia Sorianello offer the intonational phonology of thirteen regional varieties of Italian, based on a corpus of more than 8,000 sentences. The chapter reveals very wide inter-dialectal but also intra-dialectal variation, related to not only phonological differences but also phonetic implementations. The authors also mention some important methodological issues and difficulties regarding ToBI labelling and underline the need for cross-system consistency. The proposed inventory for the thirteen regional varieties comprises two monotonal and seven bitonal pitch accents, some of which may have up to three different phonetic realizations (p. 147). As for nuclear configurations, the varieties exhibit twenty of them (p. 191), some of them differing only slightly (e.g., L+H\* LH% vs. L+H\* L!H%). Additionally, Italian seems to be the only Romance language which displays a contrastive use of alignment in the nuclear accents in some dialects (L\*+H and L\*+>H). So, yet again, the book shows how important it is to take into account both the phonetic and the phonological intonational level. Just as with segments (vowels and consonants), there are pitch accents which may be contrastive in one variety but not in another.

In Chapter 6, Rafèu Sichel-Bazin, Trudel Meisenburg, and Pilar Prieto describe the intonation phonology of Occitan. This contribution follows upon the project *Atlàs interactiu de l'intonacion de l'occitan* (Prieto et al. 2007–2014), whose website offers audio and video materials for the study of prosody and intonation in different dialects of this language. Though this chapter covers ten different Occitan-speaking locations, the bulk of the data analysed comes from the Lengadocian dialect. The authors demonstrate Occitan's intermediate between French on the one hand and its southern Italo- and Ibero-Romance neighbours on the other. Whereas Occitan spoken in France shares, not surprisingly, many prosodic properties with French (e.g., the tonal structure of the Accentual Phrase),

other varieties of Occitan have some Spanish, Catalan, or Italian intonational features, depending on where the variety is spoken. The results thus show how the language contact situation may significantly intervene in prosodic systems and contribute to sound change.

Chapter 7 offers a first ToBI analysis of Portuguese and its dialects. The contribution by Sónia Frota, Marisa Cruz, Flaviane Svartman, Gisela Collischonn, Aline Fonseca, Carolina Serra, Pedro Oliveira, and Marina Vigário studies intonational variation across dialects, specifically four European and four Brazilian varieties. Largely a continuation of the *Interactive Atlas of the Prosody of Portuguese* (Frota & Cruz 2012–2015), this cross-dialectal analysis shows that Brazilian and European Portuguese display substantial differences in the distribution of pitch accents and in the nuclear configurations of various sentence types. Interestingly, Standard European Portuguese exhibits few pitch accents within an Intonational Phrase, which makes it quite unique not only among Brazilian and other European Portuguese varieties but among Romance languages in general.

Doina Jitcă, Vasile Apopei, Otilia Păduraru, and Samuil Marușca propose a Romanian ToBI in Chapter 8, analysing two main dialectal varieties, Moldavian and Transylvanian. Since Romanian is geographically isolated from the rest of the Romance-speaking area, it exhibits many archaic features and linguistic peculiarities. In terms of intonation, the authors claim that the tonal pattern of wh-questions in Romanian puts this language within the Balkan group: in Romanian, the wh-word receives the nuclear pitch accent of the utterance and is followed by postfocal deaccentuation. In contrast, other Romance languages (with a few exceptions like Sardinian) prefer statement-like intonation in wh-questions. In comparing the Moldavian and Transylvanian varieties, it is shown that they differ especially in the pitch realization of information-seeking yes/no questions. Interestingly, yes/no questions generally display strong inter-variety intonational variation, as some of the other chapters show.

Chapter 9 by Maria del Mar Vanrell, Francesc Ballone, Carlo Schirru, and Pilar Prieto describes the intonation and phrasing patterns of Sardinian, analysing two of the main Sardinian varieties, which exhibit only a few differences in their intonation. Of particular interest here is the systematic presence of secondary accents (or «initial prominences»), for which cases the authors propose a «double» pitch accent label on the word in question. Moreover, like Friulian, Sardinian has a small inventory of nuclear configurations and boundary tones. In this case, it is suggested that the limited intonational repertory is compensated for by a more

extensive use of especially sentence-initial particles. This shows again that in order to fully model intonation, it is necessary to take into account different non-intonation elements, such as any morpho-syntactical features, particles, or lexical markers which impact significantly on pragmatic meaning.

The last of the nine languages is Spanish, discussed in Chapter 10 by José Ignacio Hualde and Pilar Prieto. The main goal of this contribution is to present a cross-dialectal summary based on earlier collective works like *Transcription of Intonation of the Spanish Language* (Prieto & Roseano 2010) and the *Interactive Atlas of Spanish Intonation* (Prieto & Roseano 2009–2013). Hualde and Prieto point out some important dialectal differences between various European as well as Latin American dialects of Spanish and underline the role of pragmatics in carrying out cross-dialectal comparisons of prosody. If the reader is not familiar with the intonational variation across Spanish dialects, I recommend having at hand the abovementioned *Transcription* in order to consult the examples to which the authors make reference.

In the concluding Chapter 11, editors Sónia Frota and Pilar Prieto offer readers a comprehensive summary of the most important similarities and differences among the nine languages presented and their dialects. The editors also formulate several issues which merit further research, such as the distribution of pitch events and phrasing properties in Romance, the presence/absence of de-accenting or tonal compression, and the different strategies used for tune–text accommodation. It might be added that future research should also take into account duration, truncation processes, tonal alignment, and pitch range effects. Furthermore, several of the perception studies mentioned in this book show the direction we should go in order to clarify the phonological distinctions among different categories.

Let me finish by saying that *Intonation in Romance* is a cross-linguistic and cross-dialectal work rich in information of value not only for phonological and intonational theories and typological studies, but also for the field of applied linguistics, particularly second language acquisition. This comprehensibly written and very well organized book is thus a must-have for all those who are interested in language variation in the Romance-speaking area and/or in prosody in general.

## REFERENCES

Aguilar, L.; C. De-la-Mota and P. Prieto (coords.) (2009–2011): *Cat\_ToBI Training Materials*.

---

[http://prosodia.upf.edu/cat\\_tobi/](http://prosodia.upf.edu/cat_tobi/) [29/09/2016]

Frota, S. and M. Cruz (coords.) (2012–2015): *Interactive Atlas of the Prosody of Portuguese Webplatform*.

<http://labfon.lettras.ulisboa.pt/InAPoP> [29/09/2016]

Prieto, P. and T. Cabré (coords.) (2007–2012): *Atles interactiu de l'entonació del català. Web page*.

<http://prosodia.upf.edu/atlesentonacio/> [29/09/2016]

Prieto, P. and P. Roseano (coords.) (2009–2013): *Atlas interactivo de la entonación del español*.

<http://prosodia.upf.edu/atlasentonacion/> [29/09/2016]

Prieto, P. and P. Roseano (eds.) (2010): *Transcription of Intonation of the Spanish Language*, München, Lincom.

Prieto, P.; R. Sichel-Bazin and T. Meisenburg (coords.) (2007–14): *Atlàs interactiu de l'intonacion de l'occitan*.

<http://prosodia.upf.edu/atlasintonacion> [29/09/2016]

Andrea Pešková  
Universität Osnabrück  
apeskova@uos.de